

Top Studies on the Science Against Transgender Interventions

September 2023

Studies that Show Transgender Interventions Harm, not Help

- This 2011 Swedish study of post-sex reassignment surgery adults showed a completed suicide rate 19 times that of the general population 10 year out, along with nearly 3 times the rate of psychiatric inpatient care.
 - Dhejne C, Lichtenstein P, Boman M, Johansson ALV, Langstrom N, et al. (2011) Long-Term Follow-Up of Transsexual Persons Undergoing Sex Reassignment Surgery: Cohort Study in Sweden. PLoS ONE 6(2): e16885. [10.1371/journal.pone.0016885](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0016885).
- This 2020 study, claiming to be the first total population study of 9.7 million Swedish residents, showed neither “gender-affirming hormone treatment” nor “gender-affirming surgery” improved the mental health benchmarks.
 - Bränström R, Pachankis JE: Reduction in mental health treatment utilization among transgender individuals after gender-affirming surgeries: a total population study. Am J Psychiatry 2020; 177:727–734. <https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.ajp.2019.19010080>
 - Kalin NH: Reassessing mental health treatment utilization reduction in transgender individuals after gender-affirming surgeries: a comment by the editor on the process (letter). Am J Psychiatry 2020; 177:765 <https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.ajp.2020.20060803>
- This 2021 comprehensive data review of all 3,754 trans-identified adolescents in US military families over 8.5 years showed that gender hormone treatment lead to increased use of mental health services and psychiatric medications, and increased suicidal ideation/attempted suicide.
 - Elizabeth Hisle-Gorman, MSW, PhD and others, Mental Healthcare Utilization of Transgender Youth Before and After Affirming Treatment, *The Journal of Sexual Medicine*, Volume 18, Issue 8, August 2021, Pages 1444–1454, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jsxm.2021.05.014>

Systematic Review that Ranks WPATH and Endo Society Guidelines as Poor Quality

This 2021 BMJ first of its kind “systematic review and quality assessment” used “to assess all international clinical practice guidelines” rated WPATH’s (World Professional Association for Transgender Health) SOC 7 with a quality score of zero out of six., and the Endocrine Society Guidelines a quality score of one out of six.

Dahlen S, Connolly D, Arif I, *et al* International clinical practice guidelines for gender minority/trans people: systematic review and quality assessment. *BMJ Open* 2021;11:e048943. doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2021-048943

Study that Shows Desistance is the Norm for Minors with Gender Dysphoria

Zucker, K. J. (2018). The myth of persistence: response to “A critical commentary on follow-up studies and ‘desistance’ theories about transgender and gender nonconforming children” by Temple Newhook et al. *International Journal of Transgenderism*, 19(2), 231–245. Published online May 29, 2018.

<http://doi.org/10.1080/15532739.2018.1468293>

Studies that Show Mental Health Problems Underlie Gender Dysphoria

- This 2018 Kaiser-Permanente study gleaned from electronic medical records of 8.8 million members in Georgia and California showed:
 - High rates of psychiatric disorders and suicidal ideation *before* gender non-congruence in teens.
 - Rates (prevalence ratios/PR) in the 6 months before first findings of GNC compared to gender congruent peers: psych disorders 7 times higher overall, vast PR for certain ones, psych hospitalizations 22-44 times higher, self harm 70-144 times higher, suicidal ideation 25-54 times higher (Tables 3 & 4 of study).
 - Suicidal ideation during said 6 months before GNC findings: 7% in biological males and 5% in biological females. Far below rates claimed by activists, but still high.

Becerra-Culqui TA, Liu Y, Nash R, et al. Mental Health of Transgender and Gender Nonconforming Youth Compared with Their Peers. *Pediatrics*. 2018;141(5):e20173845.

- This 2015 report from Finland’s gender identity services found:
 - 75% of adolescents they saw were or had been undergoing psychiatric treatment for reasons other than gender dysphoria.
 - 26% had autism spectrum disorder. 87% female.
 - “Treatment guidelines need to consider gender dysphoria in minors in the context of severe psychopathology and developmental difficulties.”

Kaltiala-Heino R, Sumia M, Työlajärvi M, Lindberg N. Two years of gender identity service for minors: overrepresentation of natal girls with severe problems in adolescent development. *Child and Adolescent Psychiatry and Mental Health* (2015) 9:9.

- This 2021 prospective study from a multidisciplinary pediatric gender service in Australia found:
 - High levels of distress (including GD), suicidal ideation (41.8%), self-harm (16.3%), and suicide attempts (10.1%).
 - High rates of comorbid mental health disorders: anxiety (63.3%), depression (62.0%), behavioral disorders (35.4%), and autism (13.9%).

- o High rates of adverse childhood experiences, with family conflict (65.8%), parental mental illness (63.3%), loss of important figures via separation (59.5%), and bullying (54.4%); and maltreatment (39.2%).
 - o Key challenges faced by the clinicians: polarized discourses; pressures to abandon the holistic [biopsychosocial] model; the difficulties of untangling gender dysphoria from comorbid factors such as anxiety, depression, and sexual abuse.
- Kozłowska K, McClure G, Chudleigh C, et al. Australian children and adolescents with gender dysphoria: Clinical presentations and challenges experienced by a multidisciplinary team and gender service. *Human Systems*. 2021;1(1):70-95. doi:[10.1177/26344041211010777](https://doi.org/10.1177/26344041211010777)

Studies Demonstrating the Fatal Flaws of the Dutch Protocol

- This 2023 report stated that, “Two Dutch studies formed the foundation and the best available evidence for the practice of youth medical gender transition. We demonstrate that this work is methodologically flawed and should have never been used in medical settings as justification to scale this “innovative clinical practice.””
 - o E. Abbruzzese, Stephen B. Levine & Julia W. Mason (2023): The Myth of “Reliable Research” in Pediatric Gender Medicine: A critical evaluation of the Dutch Studies—and research that has followed, *Journal of Sex & Marital Therapy*, DOI: [10.1080/0092623X.2022.2150346](https://doi.org/10.1080/0092623X.2022.2150346)“
- Michael Biggs (2022) The Dutch Protocol for Juvenile Transsexuals: Origins and Evidence, *Journal of Sex & Marital Therapy*, DOI: [10.1080/0092623X.2022.2121238](https://doi.org/10.1080/0092623X.2022.2121238)

Comprehensive literature reviews finding studies in favor of transgender interventions to be of low to very low quality, leading to these three nations reversing course from pro-transition to strong, deep, and extended emphasis on mental health issues

- Sweden 2023. Ludvigsson, J.F., Adolfsson, J., Höistad, M., Rydelius, P.-A., Kriström, B. and Landén, M. (2023), A systematic review of hormone treatment for children with gender dysphoria and recommendations for research. *Acta Paediatr*. Accepted Author Manuscript. <https://doi.org/10.1111/apa.16791>
- Swedish Agency for Health Technology Assessment and Assessment of Social Services’ 2019 literature review. <https://www.sbu.se/en/publications/sbu-bereder/gender-dysphoria-in-children-and-adolescents-an-inventory-of-the-literature/>
- Finland 2020: “Recommendation of the Council for Choices in Health Care in Finland (PALKO / COHERE Finland). Medical Treatment Methods for Dysphoria Related to Gender Variance In Minors” https://segm.org/sites/default/files/Finnish_Guidelines_2020_Minors_Unofficial%20Translation.pdf
- 2020. UK’s The National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) reviews:
 - o N.I.C.E. Evidence review: Gonadotrophin releasing hormone analogues for children and adolescents with gender dysphoria.:

- <https://ia802301.us.archive.org/4/items/gov.uscourts.ared.128159/gov.uscourts.ared.128159.45.9.pdf> or <https://cass.independent-review.uk/nice-evidence-reviews/>
- o N.I.C.E. Evidence review: Gender-affirming hormones for children and adolescents with gender dysphoria.:
<https://cass.independent-review.uk/nice-evidence-reviews/>
 - UK: Cass Review, Interim Report (2022)
<https://cass.independent-review.uk/publications/interim-report/>
 - o This led to the closure of the world's largest pediatric gender clinic, NHS GIDS.



A project of the American College of Pediatricians